|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| cetlogo ***CHEMICAL ENGINEERING TRANSACTIONS***  ***VOL. 92, 2022*** | A publication of  aidiclogo_grande |
| The Italian Association  of Chemical Engineering  Online at www.cetjournal.it |
| Guest Editors: Rubens Maciel Filho, Eliseo Ranzi, Leonardo Tognotti  Copyright © 2022, AIDIC Servizi S.r.l. **ISBN** 978-88-95608-90-7; **ISSN** 2283-9216 | |

**On the Use of Agro-industrial Wastewaters to Promote Mixotrophic Metabolism in *Chlorella vulgaris*:**

**Effect on FAME Profile and Biodiesel Properties**

Tea Miottia, Luigi Pivettia, Veronica Lollib, Francesco Sansonea, Alessandro Concasc, Giovanni Antonio Lutzud\*

aDepartment of Chemistry, Life Sciences and Environmental Sustainability, University of Parma, Parco Area delle Scienze 11/A, 43124 Parma (PR), Italy

bDepartment of Food and Drug, University of Parma, Parco Area delle Scienze 27/A, 43124 Parma (PR), Italy

cDepartment of Mechanical, Chemical and Materials Engineering, University of Cagliari, Piazza d’Armi, 09123 Cagliari (CA), Italy

dTeregroup Srl, via David Livingstone 37,41123 Modena, (MO), Italy

\*gianni.lutzu@teregroup.net

The increase of greenhouse gases into the atmosphere, mainly due to industrialization, has affected all the ecosystems. Current worldwide living standards are still heavily dependent on non-renewable fuels. The inevitable depletion of fossil fuels and the adverse climate changes push the scientific community to seek renewable and sustainable sources of fuel. In this scenario microalgae can be potentially exploited as renewable and environmentally friendly fuel resources. Wastewaters (WW) can be used as culture media minimizing the costs associated to their cultivation. Hence, the goal of this study was to examine the effect of agro-industrial WWs rich in organic nutrients on algal lipid content and fatty acid methyl esters (FAME) profile. For this purpose, the fresh water green algae *Chlorella vulgaris* was selected. This strain isable to thrive in a wide range of WWs with high biomass productivity and to shift its metabolism from autotrophic to hetero/mixotrophic one. *C. vulgaris* was cultivated in brewery (BWW), dairy (DWW), oil mill WWs and media supplemented with sugarcane molasses. High biomass yields were obtained when *C. vulgaris* was cultivated in BWW and DWW (1.76 g L-1 and 1.56 g L-1, respectively) compared to the control and the other WWs. The assessment of FAMEs composition (i.e. level of unsaturation) of algae cultivated under all the investigated conditions demonstrated that the former ones can be viably used as sources for producing biofuels.

* 1. Introduction

In the last 100 years the exponential use of fossil fuels and the development of industrialization have emitted into the atmosphere tons of carbon dioxide (CO2) producing a sharp global increase in temperature. Human activities have generated huge amounts of greenhouse gases (GHG) producing disastrous consequences on ecosystems (Elias, 2020). Therefore, there is an urgent call at global level to seek renewable and sustainable sources of fuel (Malins, 2017). In this scenario, the scientific community emphasizes the exploitation of environmentally friendly resources. To this aim, microalgae show high productivities in terms of biomass and lipid content making them suitable for biofuels production (Soru et al., 2019, Concas et al., 2021a).

Wastewaters (WWs) typically contain large amounts of nutrients, such as carbon (C), nitrogen (N), phosphorus (P) and trace elements to sustain algal growth. It is well demonstrated the ability of microalgae to combine their growth with the biological WW treatment and biofuels production (Concas et al. 2021b, Hussain et al., 2021, Lutzu et al., 2020a). The presence inside a WW of inorganic and organic C makes some algae strains able to modulate their metabolism from autotrophic into a mixotrophic one depending on the carbon sources available. The use of food industry WWs, such as dairy (Khalaji et al., 2021), molasses sugarcane (Piaseka et al., 2017), brewery (Ferreira et al., 2019) as a nutrient medium for microalgae cultivation is well established. *Chlorella vulgaris*, one of the well-known single-celled green microalgae, can accumulate lipids and produce biodiesel under suitable stress conditions (Ratomski et Hawrot-Paw, 2021). This strain is also able to shift its exclusively autotrophic or heterotrophic metabolism into a mixotrophic one, leading to an increase in biomass production. The influence of mixotrophy on lipid content and FAME composition is well documented for many *Chlorella* strains (Centeno de Rosa et al., 2020). Molasses wastes are particularly rich in glucose which can enhance biomass productivity by microalgae once available in the culture medium (Yan et al., 2011). Hence, by considering the potential use of WWs as media for microalgae cultivation, such as dairy wastewater (DWW), brewery wastewater (BWW), oil wastewater (OWW), and sugarcane molasses effluent (MOL), the effect of different organic wastes from food industry on *C. vulgaris* lipid production is reported in this study. A close analysis of FAMEs profile is also assessed in order to compare its compliance to standard directives for biodiesel.

**2. Material and Methods**

**2.1 Inoculum, culture medium and wastewater preparation**

The strain used in this study, *Chlorella vulgaris* SAG 211-12, was obtained from the culture collection of algae at the University of Gottingen, Germany (SAG, 2021). Detailed chemical composition of the culture maintenance media is available on the SAG official website. The strain was maintained in 150 mL glass tubes containing the growth medium recommended by SAG at room temperature. Two 32 W white fluorescent tubes continuously provided a photosynthetic photon flux density (PPFD) of 50 µmol m−2 s−1. Inoculum was maintained in cultivation for about one week once it reached the end of exponential growth phase. WW samples were collected from brewery, dairy, oil mill and molasses sugarcane facilities located in Modena, Italy. An average range of the main chemical-physical parameters for both effluents is shown in Table 1. Once collected WWs were stored at 4º C before their use. Later they were filtered using glass filter microfiber disks (GF/CTM 47 mm diameter, Whatman, Incofar Srl, Modena, MO, Italy), deprived of solid materials and then sterilized at 121º C and 0.1 MPa for 20 min before microalgal cultivation.

**2.2 Algae Cultivation**

500 ml glass flasks, thereafter denominated PBRs, were used for algae cultivation. PBRs were covered with a cotton cup for air diffusion (0.03% CO2 v v-1) and daily shaken manually at room temperature. They were illuminated with a photoperiod of 12 h light/12 h dark by white fluorescent lamps providing a light intensity of 85 µmol m-2 s-1. The initial working volume of the PBRs and cell concentration were 300 ml and 0.1 g L-1, respectively. The culture medium used as control was a modified Doucha whose composition was obtained by adding to 1 L of distilled water 10 ml of five stock solutions, NaNO3 (38.92g 250mL-1 H2O), KH2PO4 (2.96g 250mL-1 H2O), MgSO47H2O (2.55g 250mL-1 H2O), CaCl26H2O (2.17g 250mL-1 H2O), EDTA-FeNa (0.5g 250mL-1 H2O), 1 ml of microelements solutions I and II, and 0.5 ml of NaOH 1 M. Microelements solution I was prepared in the following manner (mg L-1): H3BO3 415, MnCl44H2O 1650, ZnSO47H2O 1350, CoSO47H2O 300, and CuSO45H2O. For solution II (mg L-1): (NH4)6Mo7O244H2O 85 and NH4VO3 7. After two weeks of cell growth, the cultures were centrifuged at 9722 g RCF-1 for 10 min. The liquid phase was separated from the pellet and the latter used for fatty acids methyl esters (FAME) analysis.

**2.3 Characterization of microalgae growth pattern**

Microalgae growth in the culture was monitored by measuring the optical density (OD) at 680 nm. The detailed procedure adopted to monitor algal growth was reported in Lutzu et al. (2020b). The cell concentration (dry weight V-1), Xdw (g L−1), specific growth rate (μ), doubling time (td) calculations were performed according to the procedures reported in detail elsewhere (Zhou and Dunford, 2017). The average biomass productivity (∆X) was expressed as:

 (1)

where the represent initial time of the cultivation period. The pH of the cultures was recorded using a pH-meter (HI 2210, Hanna Instruments, Woonsocket, RI, US).

**2.4 FAMEs determination**

FAMEs were prepared according to a modified protocol reported by Lage and Gentili (2018). Briefly, a toluene solution and a 1% H2SO4 solution in anhydrous methanol were used to re-suspend freeze-dried cells to improve the methylation of non-polar lipids and their trans-methylation, respectively. A tricosanoic acid methyl ester (TAME) (CH3(CH2)21COOCH3) in hexane was added as an internal standard. The FAMEs were then extracted with an extractive solution (5 ml 5% NaCl + 7 ml hexane) and after phase separation, the organic phase was quantitatively analyzed by a 7820A Gas Chromatopraph (Agilent Technologies, Palo alto, CA, US) coupled to a 5977B Mass Spectrometer (Agilent Technologies Palo alto, CA, US). The system GC-MS systems (split mode 20:1, split flow 19.6 ml min-1) was equipped with a low polarity Supelco SLB-5 GC capillary column (30 m x 0.25 mm x 0.25 µm). Helium was used as carrier gas. The injector and detector temperatures were set at 280 °C and 230 °C, respectively. The chromatogram was recorded in the scan mode (40-500 m z-1) with a programmed temperature from 60 °C to 280 °C. The identification and quantification of individual FAMEs were performed by using a standard reference solution obtained by mixing Supelco 37 Component FAME Mix® (Sigma Aldrich, Saint Louis, MO, US), TAME internal standard solution and hexane. The content of FAMEs was calculated by manually integrating their peak areas with respect to the internal standard TAME, after calculation of the response factor (RF) using the standard reference solution. Finally, fatty acid (FA) levels were expressed as g 100 g-1 total FAs.

**2.5 Data Analysis**

All the experiments with algae and analytical tests were carried out at least in duplicate, typically in triplicate, and for all of them the mean values were reported. SAS 9.3 (SAS Institute Inc., Cary, NC, US) was used for the statistical analyses of the data. The regression equations correlating dry biomass concentration to OD, and to µ were calculated using Microsoft Office Excel program (Excel 2016 Ink, Microsoft, US).

* 1. Results and Discussion
     1. *C. vulgaris* growth in agro-industrial wastewater

Agro-industrial WWs are characterized by huge amount of organic matter as demonstrated by the high BOD and COD values reported for DWW, BWW, OMW and MOL (Table 1). On the other hands, these waters are poor in N and P. To verify whether the organic load is able to enhance *C. vulgaris* biomass production a series of growth experiments were carried out using three different agro-industrial WWs and regular Doucha medium as control.

Table 1: Range of main chemical-physical parameters reported for wastewater and effluents tested

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| *BOD5 (g L-1)**COD (g L1)* | *TSS (g L-1)* | *TN (g TN (g L-1)* | *TP (g L-1) pH Ref.* |
| DWW 0.24-5.90 0.50-10.40 | 0.06-5.80 | 0.01-0.66 | 0-0.060 4.0-11.0 Turinayo, 2017 |
| BWW 1.61-3.98 1.09-8.92 | 0.53-3.73 | 0.11-0.50 | 0.075-0.07 4.6-7.3 Erinan et al., 2015 |
| MOL 1.30-4.70 0.80-3.80 | 1.50-9.10 | 0.04-0.07 | 0.01-0.02 3.8-4.3 Brazzale et al., 2019 |
| OMW 35-110 40-220 | - | 0.60-2.10 | 0.15-0.30 4.0-6.0 Khdair et al., 2020 |

Note: DWW = dairy wastewater, BWW = brewery wastewater, MOL = molasses effluent, OMW = oil mill wastewater, BOD = Biological Oxygen Demand, COD = Chemical Oxygen Demand, TSS = Total Suspended Solids, TN = Total Nitrogen, TP = Total Phosphorous.

As it can be seen in Table 2 DWW, BWW and C+MOL greatly increased the biomass concentration (1.76 g L-1, 1.56 g L-1,1.47 g L-1, respectively) compared to the control (1.37 g L-1), while when OMW medium was used, there was not any growth at all probably due both to the high density and the very dark colour of the solution that prevented light penetration (data not shown). The addition of molasses to the control produced a little increase both in terms of biomass production and biomass productivity. This trend was more evident with BWW and DWW. This aspect can be related to the addition to the culture medium of more C by the organic matter contained in these WWs.

Table 2: Growth characteristics of C. vulgaris cultivated in different media

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Growth medium | µ (day-1) | td (day) | Xmax (g L-1) ∆X (mg L-1 day-1) |
| Doucha | 0.195 ± 0.03 | 3.62 ± 0.53 | 1.37 ± 0.06 91 ± 0.004 |
| BWW | 0.113 ± 0.02 | 5.63 ± 0.06 | 1.76 ± 0.25 111 ± 0.02 |
| DWW | 0.141 ± 0.03 | 5.01 ± 0.54 | 1.56 ± 0.40 119 ± 0.005 |
| C+MOL | 0.215 ± 0.21 | 3.25 ± 0.34 | 1.47 ± 0.12 94 ± 0.008 |

Note: µ: specific growth rate, td:doubling time, Xmax:maximum biomass concentration, ∆X: average biomass productivity.

Doucha medium: Control, BWW: brewery wastewater, DWW: dairy wastewater, C+MOL: Control + molasses effluent

Many studies reported that *C. vulgaris* can live at lower N concentration while it is very difficult that it can survive in absence of P. In this way, P represents the limiting factor for its growth. The optimum N/P ratio for *C. vulgaris*’s growth is set as 16:1 (Wu et al. 2014). In our growth test, N/P ratios of WW are far away from this optimum. In DWW the N/P ratio is 13:1, while in BWW, OMW and C-MOL is 7:1, 7:1, and 3.5:1, respectively. Only the control is close to the optimum, with a N/P ratio of 13:1. It has been also reported that algal specific growth rate can be significantly improved by nutrient supplementation (Lutzu et al., 2020b). In our study µ was lowered in BWW and DWW, while when the control was amended with molasses µ increased. Organic sources can be used by microalgae to shift their metabolism from autotrophy to mixothophy. This can explain why *C. vulgaris*, when cultivated in BWW, DWW and MOL media, attained a better biomass concentration compared to the control alone where there are not at all organic compounds. On the other hand, the scarcity of N and P, typical of wastes rich in organic matter, leads to an imbalance between the ratios C:N:P with respect to the optimal values for algae. This would lead to an excessive intracellular storage of C in the form of neutral lipids such as triacylglycerols rather than as proteins which would require N.

**3.2 FAME profile of *C. vulgaris* under agro-industrial wastewaters**

The composition of FAs in terms of length and branching of the carbon chain, and degree of unsaturation is a fundamental prerequisite for considering microalgal biomass as a feedstock for biodiesel production. Therefore, the FAME profile of *C. vulgaris*, obtained after the esterification of FAs, is reported in Figure 1. Both the two organic media and the control exhibithed an high perentage of long-chain compounds C16-C18 (91.5%-95.3%). The most represented FAs for the three media were oleic (C18:1), palmitoleic (C16:0) and linoleic (C18:2) ones. In particular C18:1 in BWW and in DWW resulted almsot doubled (42%) and greatly increased (34%) compared to the control (23%), respectively. Interestingly, linolenic acid (C18:3) was the highest (13.6%) only in the control while it was absent in the two organic media. The stearic acid (C18:0) resulted higher in DWW and BWW than the control, high percentages of C16:3 were found in BWW (5.82%). On the other hand, C18:2 was reduced in DWW (13.2%) and increased in BWW (17.1%) compared to the control (15%), respectively. In terms of degree of saturation and unsaturation the unsaturated fatty acids (UFA) represented the main components of FAMEs in BWW (74%), the saturated fatty acids (SFA) in DWW (40%), the monunsaturated fatty acids (MUFA) in BWW (44%), and polyunsaturated fatty acids (PUFA) in the control (38%). The content of total SFA (25.07%), total UFA (73.92%) and C16:0 (14.48%) found in BWW for *C. vulgaris* was in agreement with those reported by Choi (2016) for the same strain cultivated in DWW (22.65%, 77.35%, and 14.32%, respectively). The high UFA/SFA ratio (2.95) was obtained when *C. vulgaris* was cultivated in BWW, being the saturation degree the lowest found for this culture medium. UFA/SFA ratio describes how SFA and UFA are distributed inside the cells. This ratio is strictly linked to the nutritional requirements of microalgae, therefore to the culture medium. Microalgal metabolism can be modulated depending on the conditions in which microalgae are grown. In particular, lipid composition in algal membrane and cytoplasm can be rearranged in terms of SFA and UFA. For example, a redistribution, which lead to an increased SFA portion, can be obtained by increasing the synthesis of neutral triglycerides at the expense of polar membrane lipids (rich in UFA) which can be partially degraded (Xin et al., 2018). This rearrangement of FAMEs can be enhanced under condition of nutrients starvation, such as those that can be found when *C. vulgaris* is grown in DWW and BWW media. One of the FAs suitable for making biodiesel is C16:0. The content of this FA remained high in DWW while decreased in the BWW suggesting that the reduced availability of macronutrients (such as N and P) in organic media compared to the control could influence the accumulation of specific FAs, such as those involved in biodiesel synthesis.



*Figure 1. Fatty acids methyl ester profile (a) and general characteristics of fatty acids (b) of C.vulgaris*

**3.3 Biodiesel properties based on FAME profile**

The possibility of using the FAMEs profile for *C. vulgaris* cultivated under organic media to evaluate the feasible production of biodiesel was further investigated by taking advantage of the software Biodiesel Analyzer© Ver. 2.2. The results of such analysis are reported in Table 3 only with reference to the parameters for which specific prescriptions of international standards existed (cf. Table 3).

*Table 3. Composition of biodiesels obtainable from C. vulgaris cultivated in Doucha, BWW and, DWW*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |  | ASTM 6751-12 | | EN 14214 | |
| Parameter | Doucha | BWW | DWW | Min | Max | Min | Max |
| C18:3 Linolenic Acid (%wt) | 13.62 | 0.33 | 0.00 | - | - | - | 12 |
| Iodine Value (/) | 85.16 | 75.48 | 56.44 | - | - | - | 120 |
| Cetane number (/) | 56.84 | 60.38 | 63.46 | 47 | - | 51 | - |
| Oxidation Stability (hr) | 6.70 | 9.28 | 11.35 | 6 | - | 8 | - |
| Viscosity (mm2 s-1) | 3.19 | 3.30 | 3.38 | 1.9 | 6 | 3.5 | 5 |
| Density (kg m-3 ) | 0.78 | 0.76 | 0.78 | - | - | 0.86 | 0.9 |

When *C. vulgaris* was cultivated in DWW and BWW most of all the parameter values related to the biodiesel obtainable complied with the range of values prescribed by the ASTM standards (ASTM 6751-12) for unblended biodiesel. In addition, most of the prescriptions of European regulation for quality biodiesel (EN 14214 and EN 590) were fulfilled by the biodiesel obtained using *C. vulgaris*, except for density values which were slightly lower than the prescribed ones. In fact, according to the European standard should be in the range 0.86 – 0.9 ton m-3. Therefore, it can be stated that the biodiesel obtainable from *C. vulgaris* cultivated under organic media would be of particularly good quality even without blending with fossil diesel.

**Conclusions**

Two organic sources of waste have been investigated to improve biomass production and FAME profile by *C. vulgaris*. The results demonstrated that BWW and DWW media could represent a costless resource of organic nutrients able to trigger biomass production (1.76 g L-1 and 1.56 g L-1)of this microalgal strain. As far as the FAME profile is concerned, *C. vulgaris* was able to modify its internal metabolism to achieve an improvement in terms of unsaturation based on the two organic media used. In particular, mixotrophy condition reduced the saturation of FAs by increasing the unsaturation level, with the highest MUFA and PUFA contents obtained under BWW. The final microalgae biomass, considering its FAME profile as well as its compliance with the standards for the quality of biodiesel, makes BWW and DWW viable options as priceless media for the cultivation of *C. vulgaris*.

**References**

Brazzale P., Bourbon B., Barrucand P., Febelon M., Guercini S., Tiarca R., 2019, Wastewater treatment in dairy processing. Bulletin of the International Dairy Federation 500, 67

Centeno de Rosa A.P., Moraes L., Greque de Morais E., Vieira Costa J.A., 2020, Fatty acids biosynthesis from *Chlorella* in autotrophic and mixotropic cultivation, Brazilian Archives of Biology and Technology 63, e20180534, doi:[10.1590/1678-4324-2020180534](http://dx.doi.org/10.1590/1678-4324-2020180534)

Choi H-J, 2016, Dairy wastewater treatment using microalgae for potential biodiesel application. Environmental Engineering Research 21, 393-400, [doi.org/10.4491/eer.2015.151](https://doi.org/10.4491/eer.2015.151)

Concas A., Steriti A., Pisu M., Cao G., 2021a, Experimental and theoretical investigation of the effects of iron on growth and lipid synthesis of microalgae in view of their use to produce biofuels. Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering 9, 105349, doi:10.1016/j.jece.2021.105349.

Concas, A., Lutzu, G.A., Dunford, N.T., 2021b, Experiments and modelling of *Komvophoron* sp. growth in hydraulic fracturing wastewater. Chemical Engineering Journal, 426: 131299, doi [10.1016/j.cej.2021.131299](http://doi.org/10.1016/j.cej.2021.131299)

Elias S.A., 2020, History of greenhouse gas warming: CO2,in: S. Elias, D. Alderton, (Eds), Encyclopedia of Geology, 2nd Edition, Academic Press, pp. 444-455.

Erinan A.M., Adeyemo J., Kumari S., Swalaha F.M., Bux F., 2015, Characterization of brewery wastewater composition. International Journal of Environmental and Ecological Engineering 9(9), 1073-1076

Ferreira A., Ribeiro B., Ferreira A.F., Tavares M.L.A., Vladic J., Vidovic S., Cvetkovic D., Melkonyan L., Avetisova G., Goginyan V., Gouveia L., 2019, *Scenedesmus obliquus* microalga-based biorefinery – from brewery effluent to bioactive compounds, biofuels, and biofertilizers – aiming at a circular bioeconomy. Biofuels, Bioproducts and BiorefIning 13:1169–1186. doi: 10.1002/bbb.2032

Hussain F., Shah S.Z., Ahmad H., Abubshait S.A., Abubshait H.A., Laref A., Manikandan A., Kusama H.S., Iqbal M., 2021, Microalgae an ecofriendly and sustainable wastewater treatment option: Biomass application in biofuel and bio-fertilizer production. A review. Renewable Sustainable Energy Review 137, 110603, doi:[10.1016/j.rser.2020.110603](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2020.110603)

Lage S., Gentili F.G., 2018, Quantification and characterization of fatty acid methyl esters in microalgae: Comparison of pretreatment and purification methods. Bioresource Technology 257, 257:121-128, doi: [10.1016/j.biortech.2018.01.153](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2018.01.153)

Lutzu G.A., Ciurli A., Chiellini C., Di Caprio F., Concas A., Dunford N.T., 2020a, Latest developments in wastewater treatment and biopolymer production by microalgae, Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering, 9(1), 104926.

Lutzu G.A., Marin M.A., Concas A., Dunford N.T., 2020b, Growing *Picochlorum oklahomensis* in hydraulic fracturing wastewater supplemented with animal wastewater. Water Air & Soil Pollution, 231, 457.

Khalaji M., Hosseini S.A., Ghorbani R., Agh N., Rezaei H., Kornaros M., Koutra E., 2021, Treatment of dairy wastewater by microalgae *Chlorella vulgaris* for biofuels production. Biomass Conversion and Biorefinery, doi.org/10.1007/s13399-021-01287-2

Khdair A., Abu-Rumman G., 2020, Sustainable environmental management and valorization option for olive mill byproducts in the Middle east and North Africa (MENA) region. Processes 8, 671, doi:10.3390/pr8060671

Malins C., 2017, What role is there for electrofuel technologies in European transport’s low carbon future? Transport and Environment, Brussels, Belgium, pp. 1-86.

Piaseka A., Kreminska I., Tys J., 2017, Enrichment of *Parachlorella kessleri* biomass with bio-products: oil and protein by utilization of beet molasses. Journal of Applied Phycology 29, 1735-1743, [doi.org/10.1007/s10811-017-1081-y](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10811-017-1081-y)

Ratomski P., Hawrot-Paw M., 2021, Influence of nutrient-stress conditions on *Chlorella vulgaris* biomass production and lipid content. Catalysts, 11, 573. https:// doi.org/10.3390/catal11050573

SAG, The Culture Collection of Algae at the University of Göttingen, Germany. <https://sagdb.uni-goettingen.de/>. Accessed on 04.04.2021.

Soru S., Malavasi V., Caboni P., Concas,A., and Cao G. 2019. Behavior of the extremophile green alga *Coccomyxa melkonianii* SCCA 048 in terms of lipids production and morphology at different pH values. Extremophiles 23, 79–89, doi.org/10.1007/s00792-018-1062-3.

Turinayo K., 2017, Physicochemical properties of sugar industry and molasses based distillery effluent and its effect on water quality of river Musamya in Uganda. International Journal of Environment, Agriculture and Biotechnology 2(3), 1064-1069, doi.org/10.22161/ijeab/2.3.8

Wu J.S., Jia R.B., Li B., Liu C.C., 2014, Study on the correlation of N, P nutrients and *Chlorella* growth. Applied Mechanics and Materials 641-642, 1183-1186.

Xin Y., Shen C., She Y., Chen H., Wang C., Wei L., Yoon K., Han D., Hu Q., Xu J., 2018, Biosynthesis of triacylglycerol molecules with a tailored PUFA profile in industrial microalgae.Molecular Plant 12,doi:10.1016/j.molp.2018.12.007.

Yan D., Lu Y., Chen Y-F., Wu Q., 2011, Waste molasses alone displaces glucose-based media formicroalgal fermentation towards cost savings biodiesel production. Bioresource Technology 102(11), 6487-6493, doi:[10.1016/j.biortech.2011.03.036](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2011.03.036)

Zhou N., Dunford N.T., 2017, Characterization of green microalgae and cyanobacteria isolated from Great Salt Plains. Transaction of the ASABE, 60(2), 283-290.

Answer to reviewer comments

REVIEWER # 1

decision: accept after minor revisions

Comments by reviewer

This study examines the effect of agro-industrial WWs rich in organic nutrients on algal lipid content and fatty acid methyl esters (FAME) profile. Chlorella vulgaris was cultivated in brewery (BWW), dairy (DWW), oil mill WWs and media supplemented with sugarcane molasses. Chlorella vulgaris is able to thrive in a wide range of WWs with high biomass productivity shifting its metabolism from autotrophic to hetero/mixotrophic one. Best biomass yields were obtained when C. vulgaris was cultivated in BWW and DWW yielding 1.76 g L-1 and 1.56 g L-1 respectively when compared to the control. The FAMEs composition obtained under all the investigated conditions demonstrated the viability of using C. vulgaris in WWs as sources for producing biofuels. Authors found that when C. vulgaris was cultivated in DWW and BWW most of all the parameter values related to the biodiesel obtainable complied with the range of values prescribed by the ASTM standards (ASTM 6751-12) and European regulation for quality biodiesel (EN 14214 and EN 590) except for density values which were slightly lower than the prescribed ones. Experimental approach is correct and appropriate, results very interesting to CET audience and scientific community in the bio-diesel sector. The manuscript deserves publication after minor revisions.

Introduction

Please correct the spelling of “vugaris” at the end of introduction section.

***Answer: the term has been corrected accordingly***

Material and methods

Author do not include the source of Oil mill wastewater used in this study. Please include it in the material and method section. When referring to oil mill wastewater do the authors mean olive oil mill wastewater?

***Answer: the source of oil mill has been included, as for the other three has been collected from a facility in Modena, and yes it is olive oil mill wastewater***

Results

Table 1: please correct the layout of the table. Authors do not report the TSS range for OMW, why? Authors should explain why they report the data ranges for the properties of the WWs and do not report the actual properties of the WWs used in their experiments, different values in BOD, COD TSS, TN, TP could differently influence microalgae growth, right?

***Answer: We have not made a chemcial analysis of our wastewater samples that is why in the Table 1 we have reported the ranges of the main propeties for the cited wastewater. For the OMW in the reference cited is not reported the value of the TSS***

Please correct “triacyclglycerols” to “triacylglycerols”

***Answer: the term has been corrected accordingly***

3.2 FAME profile of C. vulgaris under agro-industrial wastewaters

Please check spelling

REVIEWER # 2

decision: accept after minor revisions

Comments by reviewer

I have carefully read the paper and I suggest to accept it for publication after very minor

revisions: Experimental approach is correct and appropriate, the text is readable and clear.

Please use "CET title" style for Title, and adopt the Capital letter for initials.

"On the Use of Agro-industrial Wastewaters to Promote Mixotrophic Metabolism in Chlorella Vulgaris:

Effect on FAME Profile and Biodiesel Properties"

Use "CET caption" style, for figures caption and "CET table title" for Tables title.

the following reference is not cited in the text:

Erinan, A.M., Adeyemo, J., Kumari, S., Swalaha, F.M., Bux, F., 2015. Characterization of brewery..............

***Answer: it was cited in the Table 1 but it was reported in a wrong way that has been corrected***

DO NOT separate names with comma

Brazzale, P., Bourbon, B., Barrucand, P.,

becomes

Brazzale P., Bourbon B., Barrucand P.,

LIST all the AUTHORS' names ( do not use et al.)

Ferreira, A., Ribeiro, B., Ferreira, A. F., Tavares, M. L. A., Vladic, J., Vidovic, S., et

Al

***Answer: all the imperfections in terms of CET stile in Title, Figures and Table captions as well as References have been corrected accordingly***